

Education, Children and Families Committee (Additional Meeting)

10.00am, Thursday 21 June 2018

Present for Item 1

Councillors Perry (Convener), Dickie (Vice-Convener), Bird, Mary Campbell, Child (substituting for Councillor Griffiths – item 3), Corbett, Howie, Mowat (substituting for Councillor Laidlaw), Neil Ross (substituting for Councillor Young – item 1), Smith, Webber (substituting for Councillor Rust), Watt (substituting for Councillor Griffiths – item 1) and Young.

Religious Representatives

Dr Rita Welsh

Parent Representative

Alexander Ramage (non-voting)

1. Update on the Informal Consultation on West/South West Schools

(a) Deputation – Juniper Green Primary School Parent Council

Kirsty Cumming and Maria Hargreaves spoke on behalf of Juniper Green Primary Parent Council.

The parent and community councils had been working together and the deputation focussed on the educational aspects of the proposals and also on issues more specific to Juniper Green Primary School. The preference was option 1 to retain all four schools on their existing sites and they urged the Committee to approve this as the way forward to statutory consultation.

The full presentation can be viewed via the link below:

https://edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/portal/webcast_interactive/358138

(b) Deputation – Juniper Green and Baberton Community Council

Aonghas McIntosh spoke on behalf of Juniper Green Community Council. Option 1 was the preferred choice of the community. He referred to catchment issues and the possible negative impact there would be on pupils, on transport and on greenspace and wildlife if any of the other options were taken forward.

The full presentation can be viewed via the link below:

https://edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/portal/webcast_interactive/358138

(c) Deputation – Woodlands School Parent Council

Julia Main and Fiona Clarke were heard on behalf of Woodlands School parent council. They welcomed the engagement which had taken place with the parent council and outlined some of the issues affecting Woodlands School pupils and families. Option 1 was the preferred choice to be taken forward.

The full presentation can be viewed via the link below:

https://edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/portal/webcast_interactive/358138

(d) Deputation – Wester Hailes Education Centre Parent Council

Amanda Campbell and Emily Bunt spoke on behalf of Wester Hailes Education Centre parent council. Amongst other issues, it was emphasised that in Wester Hailes pupils had developed strong relationships with their peers and teachers they knew and were familiar with. It would be detrimental to pupils for them to move to a school which was much larger and less personal. . Option 1 was the preferred choice to be taken forward.

The full presentation can be viewed via the link below:

https://edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/portal/webcast_interactive/358138

(e) Deputation – Currie Community High School Parent Council

Naomi Barton spoke on behalf of Currie Community High School parent council. Option 1 with investment in new and refurbished buildings for all local community high schools would provide the best education for pupils and would best meet travel, environmental and community needs.

The full presentation can be viewed via the link below:

https://edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/portal/webcast_interactive/358138

(f) Deputation – Currie Primary School Parent Council

Lisa Syme and Dr Helen Wright spoke on behalf of Currie Primary School parent council. The deputation referred to the impact of the proposals on catchments and pupil numbers and the need to minimise disruption for pupils.

Concerns were expressed about the impact on attainment. Option 1 was the preferred choice to be taken forward.

The full presentation can be viewed via the link below:

https://edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/portal/webcast_interactive/358138

(g) Deputation – Joint Deputation from Canal View and Clovenstone Primary Parent Councils

Sam Laidlaw and Ashley McNeill spoke on behalf of Canal View and Clovenstone Primary Schools parent councils. Option 2 was the preferred choice as it was felt this would provide the stability and the best opportunity for success in their children's future education.

The full presentation can be viewed via the link below:

https://edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/portal/webcast_interactive/358138

(h) Deputation – Joint Deputation from Sighthill Primary School Parent Council and Calder's Children's Zone

Michelle Robson and Leah Robertson spoke on behalf of Sighthill Primary School Parent Council and Calder's Children's Zone. The deputation spoke about the difficulties encountered by parents being able to engage with the consultation process as a large number of families had English as a second language. Option 1 was the preferred choice to be taken forward to keep children at the local school within the community.

The full presentation can be viewed via the link below:

https://edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/portal/webcast_interactive/358138

(i) Deputation – Educational Institute of Scotland

Alison Murphy (Local Association Secretary) spoke on behalf of the Educational Institute of Scotland. She indicated that the contributions from parents had been superb, the role of the community was important and school resources were stretched. Option 1 should be supported to ensure that schools were at the heart of the community and that the excellent provision they gave was maintained.

The full presentation can be viewed via the link below

https://edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/portal/webcast_interactive/358138

(j) Report by the Executive Director for Communities and Families

At a special meeting of the Education, Children and Families Committee on 29 March 2018 a report on the Outcomes of the Informal Consultation in West and South West Edinburgh was considered.

The report provided details of the informal consultation process, an assessment of the original proposal for school catchment and infrastructure changes published during the informal consultation and an assessment of three alternative options created as a response to the information received during the informal consultation.

A further update report on the informal consultation was submitted to Committee on 22 May 2018. The Committee agreed to continue consideration of the report to this meeting in order to investigate the issues that had arisen both during and since the special meeting held on 29 March 2018, as part of the consultations and further deputations heard today.

Information was provided on the various issues raised which included school sites and catchment areas and educational issues relating to curriculum choice, optimum school capacity and any impact on pupils with additional learning needs attending a larger school.

Motion

- 1) To agree that determination of locations for new school infrastructure in west Edinburgh (Kirkliston, Hillwood, Maybury and Cammo areas) be progressed through development of a West Edinburgh spatial strategy to be prepared as part of the new Local Development Plan process and that statutory consultations would be progressed when the spatial framework had been completed.
 - 2) To agree that Option 4 would be progressed for statutory consultation.
 - 3) To set up a working group to take account of the views expressed by the deputations and to develop a long term plan for education in the Wester Hailes community, including but not limited to:
 - Research to understand the decisions parents and young people make about placing choices
 - Dealing with reputation and communication issues
 - Strengthening the curriculum offer
 - Strengthening the partnership with feeder primaries and nearby high schools
 - Consideration of options for a 're-brand' of WHEC in response to concerns raised by some of the parents at the feeder schools, and to explore the feasibility of introducing a specialism in its curriculum such as a focus on Digital & IT skills and/or vocational skills, encouraging placement requests to come in, for those wishing to develop these skills for employment or further education.
- moved by Councillor Perry, seconded by Councillor Dickie

Amendment

- 1) To note the report and welcome the additional information provided since the last meeting on 22nd May for the different options presented on the South West Schools.
- 2) To note that Committee was encouraged by the strong connections that had now been forged between schools in the South West and welcomes their intentions to continue with that collaborative relationship moving forward.

- 3) To recognise the work involved by Council officials in the progress towards securing a site for a new West Edinburgh School on the outskirts of Kirkliston which had been welcomed by the community.
- 4) To recognise the extensive period of consultation that had now taken place and the desire of those involved to come to a resolution for all the communities involved.
- 5) To agree to progress with the negotiations for the new West Edinburgh High School off Burnshot Road to the north-east of Kirkliston and to report back to the next Education Committee meeting in August 2018.
- 6) To agree to progress with statutory consultation on the new West Edinburgh site option when practical.
- 7) To note that Option 1 emerged with significant support from the informal consultation and offered the clearest pathway to delivery, being based on existing sites.
- 8) To note that Option 1 was the second most cost-effective option.
- 9) To recognise the impact of the cross-community effort from the Save Our Schools Action Group, the way they had conducted their campaign and their inclusive approach throughout.
- 10) To recommend that Option 1 be taken forward to statutory consultation.
- 11) To note only Option 1 addressed the issues raised by Woodlands, in particular the needs of children attending Woodlands School and the strong preference expressed by learners, parents and staff to retain the school in its current site and the significant impact any move and a significantly larger school roll could have on the health and wellbeing of these vulnerable young people. Option 1 also provided Woodlands children with complex learning needs and autism to access an inclusive educational setting due to the very strong links with Currie Community High School and the local community.
- 12) To note that the Educational Institute for Scotland had supported Option 1 as the best option, stating that “These schools have spent decades developing their educational offer, and building relationships with pupils, families and the communities – relationships that are at the heart of challenging the equity gap and raising attainment.” and had further stated “members of the EIS believe these can best be achieved by developing and evolving the existing provision, rather than by undertaking a radical reorganisation.

Key to this is the desire to retain both Currie Community High School (CCHS) and Wester Hailes Educational Centre (WHEC) at the heart of their respective communities, and to keep the strong links between CCHS and Woodlands School.”
- 13) To recognise the views expressed by some staff and parents and staff within WHEC feeder primaries about the importance of maximising the educational and other opportunities for young people in the Wester Hailes area.

- 14) Therefore, to request that a working group be set up to take account of the views expressed in point 13) above and to develop a long term plan for education in the Wester Hailes community, including but not limited to:
- Research to understand the decisions parents and young people make about placing choices
 - Dealing with reputation and communication issues
 - Strengthening the curriculum offer
 - Strengthening the partnership with feeder primaries and nearby high schools
 - Consideration of options for a “re-brand” of WHEC in response to concerns raised by some of the parents at the feeder schools, and to explore the feasibility of introducing a specialism in its curriculum such as a focus on Digital & IT skills and/or vocational skills, encouraging placement requests to come in, for those wishing to develop these skills for employment or further education.
- 15) To request an update on and full remit for setting up the working group to be reported to the Committee in August 2018.

- moved by Councillor Webber, seconded by Councillor Mary Campbell

Voting

For the motion - 5

For the amendment - 7

(For the motion – Councillors Bird, Dickie, Howie, Perry and Watt)

(For the amendment – Councillors Mary Campbell, Corbett, Mowat, Neil Ross, Smith and Webber; Rev Dr Rita Welsh)

Decision

- 1) To note the report and welcome the additional information provided since the last meeting on 22nd May for the different options presented on the South West Schools.
- 2) To note that Committee was encouraged by the strong connections that had now been forged between schools in the South West and welcomes their intentions to continue with that collaborative relationship moving forward.
- 3) To recognise the work involved by Council officials in the progress towards securing a site for a new West Edinburgh School on the outskirts of Kirkliston which had been welcomed by the community.
- 4) To recognise the extensive period of consultation that had now taken place and the desire of those involved to come to a resolution for all the communities involved.
- 5) To agree to progress with the negotiations for the new West Edinburgh HS off Burnshot Road to the north-east of Kirkliston and to report back to the next Education Committee meeting in August 2018.

- 6) To agree to progress with statutory consultation on the new West Edinburgh site option when practical.
- 7) To note that Option 1 emerged with significant support from the informal consultation and offered the clearest pathway to delivery, being based on existing sites.
- 8) To note that Option 1 was the second most cost-effective option.
- 9) To recognise the impact of the cross-community effort from the Save Our Schools Action Group, the way they had conducted their campaign and their inclusive approach throughout.
- 10) To recommend that Option 1 be taken forward to statutory consultation.
- 11) To note only Option 1 addressed the issues raised by Woodlands, in particular the needs of children attending Woodlands School and the strong preference expressed by learners, parents and staff to retain the school in its current site and the significant impact any move and a significantly larger school roll could have on the health and wellbeing of these vulnerable young people. Option 1 also provided Woodlands children with complex learning needs and autism to access an inclusive educational setting due to the very strong links with Currie Community High School and the local community.
- 12) To note that the Educational Institute for Scotland had supported Option 1 as the best option, stating that “These schools have spent decades developing their educational offer, and building relationships with pupils, families and the communities – relationships that are at the heart of challenging the equity gap and raising attainment.” and had further stated “members of the EIS believe these can best be achieved by developing and evolving the existing provision, rather than by undertaking a radical reorganisation. Key to this is the desire to retain both Currie Community High School (CCHS) and Wester Hailes Educational Centre (WHEC) at the heart of their respective communities, and to keep the strong links between CCHS and Woodlands School.”
- 13) To recognise the views expressed by some staff and parents and staff within WHEC feeder primaries about the importance of maximising the educational and other opportunities for young people in the Wester Hailes area.
- 14) Therefore, to request that a working group be set up to take account of the views expressed in point 13) above and to develop a long term plan for education in the Wester Hailes community, including but not limited to:
 - Research to understand the decisions parents and young people make about placing choices
 - Dealing with reputation and communication issues
 - Strengthening the curriculum offer
 - Strengthening the partnership with feeder primaries and nearby high schools

- Consideration of options for a “re-brand” of WHEC in response to concerns raised by some of the parents at the feeder schools, and to explore the feasibility of introducing a specialism in its curriculum such as a focus on Digital & IT skills and/or vocational skills, encouraging placement requests to come in, for those wishing to develop these skills for employment or further education.

15) To request an update on and full remit for setting up the working group to be reported to the Committee in August 2018.

(References – Education, Children and Families Committee, 22 May 2018 (item 1); report by the Executive Director for Communities and Families, submitted)

Declaration of Interests

Dr Rita Welsh declared a non-financial interest in the above item as she was a member of the ministry team at Holy Trinity Church, a resident in Currie and had a grandchild who attended a primary school affected by the proposals.

2. Chair

In the absence of the Convener, Councillor Dickie took the Chair for the following item of business.

3. Wave 4 Education Infrastructure Prioritisation

(a) Deputation – Friends of Castlebrae Community High School

Donna Mason, Brandon Robertson, Charley Reid and Shania Muir spoke on behalf of Castlebrae Community High School. The deputation would welcome a new school building in the community. This would enhance the teaching and learning experience of pupils attending the school. There was already a great community spirit within the school. The deputation asked the Committee to progress with the delivery of the replacement High School for Castlebrae as part of the Wave 4 project.

The full presentation can be viewed via the link below:

https://edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/portal/webcast_interactive/358138

(b) Deputation – Liberton High School Parent Council

Derek McNeill, Marion Hemingway-Brunt and Sarah Hand spoke on behalf of Liberton High School parent council. The deputation advised there had been little or no change of infrastructure within the school for a number of years.

The building urgently required upgrading to improve the learning environment for the students and teachers in the school. The deputation asked the Committee to progress with a new build school for the community in Liberton.

The full presentation can be viewed via the link below:

https://edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/portal/webcast_interactive/358138

(c) Deputation – Ian Murray, MP and Daniel Johnson, MSP

Ian Murray, MP and Daniel Johnson, MSP were heard on the proposals for Liberton High School and the excellent learning and teaching that was delivered to students. Liberton was the only school in the cluster that hadn't had modification or refurbishment. The deputation referred to the large amount of housing development that was planned in the south east wedge area. The deputation asked the Committee to postpone any decision on the matter to allow members to undertake a site visit to the school and to allow further time for members to examine the parent council minutes of meetings on the issue.

The full presentation can be viewed via the link below:

https://edinburgh.public-i.tv/core/portal/webcast_interactive/358138

(d) Report by the Executive Director for Communities and Families

The Committee had previously agreed the criteria which would be used to prioritise secondary school infrastructure investment in the Wave 4 programme.

The outcomes of the prioritisation process were submitted together with recommendations on initial investment opportunities.

Decision

- 1) To note the outcome of the Wave 4 prioritisation process.
- 2) To agree that the current Wave 4 capital allocation of £25m was aligned to delivery of the Castlebrae High School replacement and Bangholm sports facility (Trinity Academy) projects.
- 3) To agree to submit a report to the Finance and Resources Committee to include details of the capital and revenue implications of proceeding with the delivery of the Castlebrae High School replacement and Bangholm sports facility (Trinity Academy) projects.
- 4) To agree that the report to Finance and Resources Committee also include detailed business cases for all of the other projects identified in the report by the Executive Director for Communities and Families so that consideration could be given to how these projects would be funded in the future.
- 5) To note that the report to the Finance and Resources Committee would require to be remitted to a full Council meeting for final approval of the proposed budget changes.
- 6) To approve that the design process for the Castlebrae High School replacement and Bangholm sports facility projects continue so that there was no delay in final delivery of these projects and notes that, if these projects were not ultimately delivered, any design costs would need to be met from existing Communities and Families revenue budgets.

- 7) To acknowledge the response from John Swinney of 15 June 2018 and welcome the announcement for future funding for schools which would be made later this year.
- 8) To agree that, in the meantime and in addition to the verbal confirmation already received, the Convener of the Education, Children and Families Committee would seek written assurance that the Council would be able to bid for Scottish Government funding retrospectively for the work undertaken on Castlebrae and Trinity.

(References – Education, Children & Families Committee 22 May 2018 (item 12); report by the Executive Director for Communities and Families, submitted)

Declaration of Interests

Councillor Perry declared a non-financial interest in the above item as his partner was employed at Liberton High School, left the meeting room and took no part in the consideration of and decision on the item.

Alex Ramage declared a non-financial interest in the above item as a member of Liberton High School parent council.